
MEETING	SCRUTINY MANAGEMENT COMMITTEE (CALLING IN)
DATE	15 JUNE 2009
PRESENT	COUNCILLORS HEALEY (CHAIR), FUNNELL (VICE-CHAIR), ORRELL, SCOTT, SIMPSON- LAING, TAYLOR, R WATSON AND HYMAN (SUBSTITUTE)
APOLOGIES	COUNCILLOR WAUDBY

1. DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members were invited to declare at this point in the meeting any personal or prejudicial interests they might have in the business on the agenda. No interests were declared.

2. PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

It was reported that there had been two registrations to speak at the meeting under the Council's Public Participation Scheme, both in relation to agenda item 4 (Called-In Item: Petitions for 20 mph Speed Limits on Residential Roads).

Anna Semelyn spoke in support of the petition for a city-wide 20 mph speed limit, stating that a city-wide limit would result in safer, quieter, less polluted and more sociable streets and that evidence from other cities indicated it was more effective than 'pockets' of speed restriction in specific areas.

Catherine Heinemeyer also spoke in support of a city-wide 20 mph speed limit, stating that it would be a valuable step in improving street safety, thus supporting York's ambition to be a 'cycling city' and helping to encourage children to start cycling and to gain more freedom.

3. MINUTES

RESOLVED: That the minutes of the Scrutiny Management Committee (Calling In) meeting held on 18 May 2009 be approved and signed by the Chair as a correct record.

4. CALLED-IN ITEM: PETITIONS FOR 20 MPH SPEED LIMITS ON RESIDENTIAL ROADS

Members received a report which asked them to consider the decisions made by the Executive Member for City Strategy, at a Decision Session held on 2 June 2009, regarding the receipt of two petitions calling for the introduction of 20 mph speed limits on residential roads in the City.

Details of the Executive Member's decisions were attached as Annex 1 to the report. The original report to the Decision Session was attached as Annex 2. The decisions had been called in by Cllrs Potter, Merrett and Simpson-Laing for the following reasons:

"The decision is flawed because although some pilot zones have been agreed, they in no way model an authority-wide default of 20 mph. Therefore no meaningful extrapolation may be made from the local area to the city-wide level."

Members were invited to decide whether to confirm the decisions of the Executive Member (Option A) or to refer them back to the Executive Member for reconsideration and / or amendment (Option B).

Cllrs Merrett and Potter addressed the meeting on behalf of the Calling-In Members. They welcomed the Executive Member's decision to extend the pilot scheme to the South Bank area but stressed that to achieve the full benefits of a reduced speed limit a comprehensive approach was needed, as had proved successful in places such as Portsmouth. The issue was one of culture change and winning 'hearts and minds' rather than one of enforcement. In response to the points raised by the Calling-In Members and public participants, Officers confirmed their advice that more evidence was needed from trials currently being carried out in York and elsewhere before a final decision could be taken on the introduction of a city-wide limit.

After a full debate, Cllr Scott moved, and Cllr Simpson-Laing seconded, that Option B be approved and the decisions referred back to the Executive Member for reconsideration and amendment. 4 Members voted for and 4 against this motion. The Chair then exercised his casting vote against the motion, which was consequently declared LOST.

Cllr Hyman then moved, and Cllr Watson seconded, that Option A be approved and the decisions of the Executive Member be confirmed. 4 Members voted for and 4 against this motion. The Chair then exercised his casting vote in favour of the motion and it was

RESOLVED: That the decisions made by the Executive Member for City Strategy on 2 June 2009 be confirmed.

REASON: In accordance with the Constitutional procedures for called-in decisions and the reasons recorded in the minutes of the Decision Session on 2 June 2009.

P Healey, Chair

[The meeting started at 5.15 pm and finished at 6.10 pm].